

O 221223Z NOV 08
FM USMISSION GENEVA
TO SECSTATE WASHDC IMMEDIATE 7583
CIA WASHINGTON DC IMMEDIATE
DIA WASHINGTON DC IMMEDIATE
JOINT STAFF WASHINGTON DC IMMEDIATE
NATIONAL SECURITY COUNCIL WASHINGTON DC IMMEDIATE
SECDEF WASHINGTON DC IMMEDIATE
USMISSION USNATO IMMEDIATE
DEPT OF ENERGY WASHINGTON DC IMMEDIATE
DTRA ALEX WASHINGTON DC IMMEDIATE
DTRA-OSES DARMSTADT GE IMMEDIATE
CNO WASHINGTON DC IMMEDIATE
DIRSSP WASHINGTON DC IMMEDIATE
INFO AMEMBASSY ASTANA PRIORITY
AMEMBASSY KYIV PRIORITY
AMEMBASSY MOSCOW PRIORITY

S E C R E T GENEVA 001016

DEPT FOR T, VCI AND EUR/PRA
DOE FOR NNSA/NA-24
CIA FOR WINPAC
JCS FOR J5/DDGSA
SECDEF FOR OSD(P)/STRATCAP
NAVY FOR CNO-N5JA AND DIRSSP
AIRFORCE FOR HQ USAF/ASX AND ASXP
DTRA FOR OP-OS OP-OSA AND DIRECTOR
NSC FOR HAYES
DIA FOR LEA

E.O. 12958: DECL: 07/17/2018

TAGS: [KACT](#) [PARM](#) [START](#) [JCIC](#) [INF](#) [US](#) [RS](#) [UP](#) [BO](#) [KZ](#)

SUBJECT: JCIC-XXXIII: (U) WORKING GROUP MEETING ON B-52
ELIMINATIONS AT DAVIS MONTHAN, NOVEMBER 20, 2008

REF: A. OIR FROM OCTOBER 2008 DATA UPDATE INSPECTION AT
DAVIS MONTHAN AFB
[1](#)B. GENEVA 2574 JCIC-XXXI-020

Classified By: Jerry A. Taylor, United States Representative
to the Joint Compliance and Inspection Commission.
Reasons: 1.5(b) and (d).

[1](#)1. (U) This is JCIC-XXXIII-018.

[1](#)2. (U) Meeting Date: November 20, 2008
Time: 3:30 P.M. - 4:30 P.M.
Place: U.S. Mission, Geneva

SUMMARY

[1](#)3. (S) A Working Group (WG) meeting was held at the U.S. Mission on November 19, 2008, to address an issue that arose during a Data Update Inspection (DUI) at Davis-Monthan Air Force Base (AFB) on October 18, 2008. The Russian delegation stated that Russian inspectors included two ambiguities in the official inspection report (Ref A). The Russian Delegation stated that the United States had undertaken elimination procedures for certain B-52 heavy bombers without the proper notifications required in the Treaty. The U.S. delegation explained that this issue was discussed in JCIC-XXXI (Ref B), and the U.S. understanding was that the issue was resolved. The U.S. delegation explained that these heavy bombers are used for aging and surveillance activities, and had not been eliminated nor had the elimination process been initiated.

OPENING SALVOS

[1](#)4. (S) At a WG meeting at the United States Mission on November 19, 2008, Yaguchi opened the meeting and gave the

floor to Ryzhkov. Ryzhkov said the United States started the elimination process of certain B-52 heavy bombers at Davis-Monthan without providing any notifications. Russia further wanted to remind the WG that during a previous session a presentation was provided by Kuz'min which outlined Russian concerns and then handed the floor over to Kuz'min.

HEY, WHO CUT THE...B-52

15. (S) Referring to the October 2008 inspection report from a Davis-Monthan AFB Data Update Inspection, Kuz'min said that inspectors noted that six B-52s had almost completed the process of elimination and one B-52 had completed elimination without any preliminary notifications. After exhaustive reference to the Treaty's notification protocol and various notification formats (57, 61 and 3), Kuz'min referred to the elimination of a B-52 ground trainer at Rome, New York. He said the United States correctly followed the conversion or elimination protocol to eliminate the B-52 from START accountability.

16. (S) Turning to Russian concerns with B-52's at Davis Monthan, Kuz'min said that in JCIC-XXXI the U.S. had explained that tail assembly cuts for certain B-52's at Davis Monthan were for studying strength capacity. He noted that the U.S. delegation had said that when the U.S. was prepared to eliminate the heavy bombers, it would issue the appropriate notifications.

17. (S) Kuz'min said that during the DUI, in October 2008, the Russian inspectors' attention was drawn to cuts made in the tail section and fuselage observing that the cuts were made not at assembly joints. Additionally, the inspectors specifically saw the tail section severed in different ways on different aircraft and also that the cuts were made in the skin of the aircraft. He asserted that the cuts were not made with an abrasive cutting tool. Kuz'min alluded to the meaning of the word "assembly joint" and the notion of returning the dismantlement back to its initial state. He said that during the inspection, Russian inspectors observed that the B-52 cuts were not at the assembly joints and were made in an irreversible manner thus precluding being able to restore the aircraft to its initial condition. For this reason, Russia believes the United States did not follow the Treaty requirement to provide the required notifications dealing with the elimination of heavy bombers.

MY PICTURES ARE BIGGER THAN YOURS

18. (S) Kuz'min then reinforced his presentation by using B-52 photos of the B-52's in question that were made during the October 2008 inspection and appended to the inspection report indicate to indicate the location of the tail section cuts and reiterated that the cuts were made in an irreversible manner.

OUR BELOVED U.S. LEADER RESPONDS

19. (S) Yaguchi thanked Kuz'min for pointing out the successful elimination of the B-52 ground trainer at Rome, New York and stated that elimination of the ground trainer exemplified the United States' knowledge about the elimination process and notification requirements. Yaguchi pointed out that the B-52s had not been eliminated and nor had the elimination process begun. Furthermore the aircraft remained accountable and inspectable under the Treaty and that they are undergoing aging and surveillance activities which were permitted under the Treaty. Moreover, the United States did not intend for the structural cuts to be associated with the beginning of the elimination process.

110. (S) Yaguchi added that should the United States decide

to eliminate any of the B-52s listed in the inspection report, they will be eliminated in a manner consistent with the provisions of the Core Protocol.

AND NOW FOLKS, THE REST OF THE STORY

¶11. (S) Ryzhkov responded that this was not a very sensitive issue with the Russian Federation because heavy bombers were eliminated not created. He understood that the United States had not started the elimination process of heavy bombers and believed the United States activities were in compliance with the Treaty. Simply, when Russian inspectors were in the field and observed situations, like at Davis-Monthan where B-52s had cuts in them, they made comments in the inspection report. From the inspectors viewpoint, it appeared as though the elimination procedures had been initiated on these airplanes. Ryzhkov stressed that he did not want to make the situation more strict or more dramatic and urged the United States to think about how to resolve the issue.

ANOTHER WE'LL GET BACK TO YOU

¶12. (S) Smith thanked Ryzhkov for not making this a more serious issue and further clarified the United States' position that the B-52s were fully accountable and inspectable under the START Treaty and when the United States decided to eliminate them, the United States would make all relevant notifications and all appropriate cuts. Yaguchi concluded the discussion by stating that the United States would take the issue back for further study.

¶13. (U) Documents exchanged: Eight B-52 photographs taken during the October 17, 2008 DUI at Davis-Monthan AFB.

¶14. (U) Participants:

U.S.
Mr. Yaguchi
Lt Col Comeau
Mr. DeNinno
Mr. Dunn
Mr. Fortier
Mr. Hanchett
Ms. Bosco
Mr. Smith
Maj Edinger
CDR Rust
Mr. Vogel
Mr. Smith
Mr. French (Int)

RUSSIA

Col Ryzhkov
Capt(1st Rank) Kuz'min
Col Novikov
Col Zaytsev
Ms. Komshilova (Int)

UKRAINE

MGen Fedotov

BELARUS

Mr. Ponomarev

¶15. (U) Taylor sends.
TICHENOR

NNNN

End Cable Text